Integrated Do No Harm and Reflecting on Peace Practice Teaching Case Study: Cité Soleil

Reference for Workshop Facilitators

by Sabina Carlson Robillard

November, 2015

A Teaching Case Study
About CDA
CDA Collaborative Learning Projects (CDA) is a non-profit organization that is committed to improving the effectiveness of local and international actors who provide humanitarian assistance, engage in peace practice, support sustainable development, and conduct corporate operations.

An electronic copy of this resource is available on the CDA website.

CDA is keen to hear how you are using our materials. Your feedback informs our ongoing learning and impact assessment processes. E-mail your feedback to feedback@cdacollaborative.org

Suggested Citation

Acknowledgments
This resource is made possible by a grant from the UK Department for International Development.

Cover photo: Cité Soleil, taken by Sabina Carlson Robillard.

© 2015 CDA Collaborative Learning Projects.

This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-ShareAlike 4.0 International License. https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-sa/4.0/legalcode
Table of Contents

Executive Summary 1
Case Study 2
Map of Cité Soleil 12
Do No Harm Analysis 13
Drivers of Conflict Analysis 16
Main Scenario 20
Program Analysis 23
Addressing Key Driving Factors 25
Organizational Impacts Discussion 26
Executive Summary

This resource is meant as guidance for Do No Harm (DNH) and Reflecting on Peace Practice (RPP) workshop facilitators using the Cité Soleil Teaching Case Study. *This resource assumes that participants are already familiar with the RPP approaches to “theory of change,” “critical detail mapping,” and the “change matrix.”*

The case study focuses on Cité Soleil, the largest slum in Haiti, and is one of the 7 municipalities that make up the capital city Port au Prince. It is an area that has experienced chronic violence for the past decade, most of which comes from armed groups of young men that are commonly referred to as gangs. The municipality is informally divided into a set of gang territories, whose boundaries shift as the gangs’ power and allegiances change. Cité Soleil experiences low rates of education and employment, suffers from a lack of state services, and is vulnerable to flooding and other disasters.

The residents of Cité Soleil, after years of negative experiences, have little trust in the government, the United Nations, and international NGOs. They are extremely suspicious of outsiders, and this adds an extra layer of complexity to any intervention that takes place in the area. At the same time, there is a serious stigma attached to Cité Soleil, and few organizations, businesses, or individuals are willing to even step foot in the municipality.

This case study will explain the background of what is currently happening in Cité Soleil, as well as developments from 2015 that altered key conflict dynamics. It will then walk participants through a series of hypothetical scenarios. Participants will be guided through planning a conflict-sensitive intervention in a place like Cité Soleil, and finding the opportunities for peacebuilding in similar situations of chronic urban violence.

*Map 1: Haiti from Nations Online Project at www.nationsonline.org.*

Case Study

Background - Haiti

Haiti is a small country in the Caribbean that shares an island with the Dominican Republic. It was a colony of France that gained independence in 1804 through a slave revolt that led to a fourteen-year revolutionary war. Because it was the only example of a successful slave rebellion, Haiti became an international pariah to the colonial and slave-owning powers of the time. Haiti has repeatedly been the site of intervention by foreign powers ever since.

After the revolution, a small group of educated, mixed-race Haitians became the dominant political and economic elite. They exerted their power over the former slaves and their descendants, and this led to an antagonistic power dynamic between the elite and the masses that continues to this day.

Haiti has almost never had a stable government: there have been approximately 55 rulers or presidents of Haiti since independence, and only 9 have successfully completed their terms. Of the others, 33 were executed, and 23 were overthrown in coup d’état. In 1986, the 35-year Duvalier dictatorship was brought to an end by a popular uprising, led by the Lavalas movement and its leader, the priest Jean Bertrand Aristide. Aristide was elected in Haiti’s first democratic election in 1990, and was overthrown by members of the Haitian army (FADH) in 1991. Aristide was very popular among the rural and urban poor, so following the coup the Haitian masses were repressed.

Aristide eventually returned from exile and was re-elected in 2000 and disbanded the FADH. But he was overthrown in a second coup in 2004, which was orchestrated by Haiti’s ex-military and economic elite\(^1\). Following this coup, the UN authorized a peacekeeping mission known as *Mission des Nations Unies pour la Stabilisation en Haïti* (MINUSTAH), with a mandate to stabilize the country.

Background - Cité Soleil

Cité Soleil is a municipality on the western edge of Haiti’s capital, Port au Prince. It only covers about 21 square kilometers, but has anywhere from 250,000 to 500,000 residents, making it the most densely populated area in the country. It is bordered by the sea and a national highway. Cité Soleil is divided into three sections: one of which is urban, two of which are pre-urban and rural. For the purpose of this case study, ‘Cité Soleil’ refers to the urban section of the municipality.

During the Duvalier regime, Cité Soleil was an industrial area devoted to sugarcane processing and housing of the factory workers. In the 1980s and 1990s, an economic crisis in rural Haiti
prompted hundreds of thousands of rural migrants to move into Cité Soleil in search for factory jobs. So many people moved to the area that they overwhelmed the available supply of housing and began building informal settlements along the sea. By the early 1990s Cité Soleil was home to hundreds of thousands of people.

The political instability of the 1990s led to the closing of many of the factories. It also led to a backlash against and repression of people in Cité Soleil, who have traditionally been pro-Aristide. The 1990s were a period of increased unemployment among Cité Soleil’s youth and a feeling of political and social marginalization, which continued to increase in the period after the second coup d’état in 2004.

**Armed Groups in Cité Soleil**

The landscape of armed actors in Haiti is complex. After the fall of the Duvalier regime, many neighborhoods armed themselves to protect their residents against the chaos and repression that followed, including Cité Soleil’s *Lanmè Wouj* (Red Army.) In the 1990s and early 2000s *Lanmè Wouj* was replaced by other armed groups.

During the rise of Aristide, many of the young people in marginalized communities were organizing themselves into *baz*, or bases, from which they could mobilize their neighborhoods for local or national action. Different political groups began arming these *baz*, including, allegedly, Aristide. Not all *baz* are armed: every neighborhood has a *baz*, and they can serve social functions, (organizing parties, community service, etc.) political functions, (attending protests, mobilizing for elections, etc.) or violent functions (crime and politically-motivated violence.) Some *baz* ended up amassing a lot of power and weapons in the 2004 period, and became what was referred to as ‘gangs’.

Complicating this are other armed groups currently operating in Haiti: there are ex-FADH soldiers, (who operate as a national network even though it is illegal) countless private militias, (belonging to the political and economic elite) and criminal networks (who are associated with powerful families.) There is a significant amount of political manipulation of armed groups and youth in general, who are often paid by politicians to create disturbances.

The police and the country’s elite also contribute to the violent environment. The police are involved in many criminal activities, and as a whole, the economic elite possess more weapons per person than the rest of the country, even when compared with active gang members.

**The Anatomy of the Gangs**

There are many different names that are used by locals to identify types of armed groups in the country’s ghettos, such as: *Bandi* (bandit), *Mafya* (mafia), *Chime* (people who supported Lavalas),
and Militant (militants). While each name marks a unique identity within the context, policy makers have typically referred to all of these armed groups with the blanket term "gang." We believe that noting the different names and what they imply is crucial for real-life interventions in this context. However, for the sake of simplicity and an English-speaking audience, this case study will also be using the term "gang."

The word ‘gang’ often carries connotations of very structured, hierarchical groups with their own colors, symbols, names, and initiation rituals. While some Cité Soleil gangs have those characteristics, most tend to have a more fluid structure. Cité Soleil gang identity is mainly based on the neighborhood the gang comes from, although a gang’s territory can expand over many neighborhoods. Because these gangs have no colors or uniform, it can be impossible to identify who is a gang member unless you are from the neighborhood.

Typically, a gang has one leader, called a chef, and a set of core (male) members, referred to as solda, or ‘soldiers’. There exists some sort of hierarchy between soldiers, but the edges of the gang are hard to define. A soldier has his own gun, that stays with him at all times. But there are many other young men who are given weapons only when needed, some who drive motorcycles for the gangs, and others who run errands or work as lookouts. Many of the soldiers become involved with the gangs as young boys: they start out as lookouts or run errands, and gradually get pulled in as they get older and gain the chef’s trust.

The gang lifestyle is precarious, mostly dependent on political patronage and robbery, gangs frequently alternate between relative wealth and complete poverty. There is a lot of fighting between gangs, as well as fighting within gangs for power and control. Few live past their 30s. Chef’s have absolute power within their neighborhoods, but can almost never leave the boundaries of the areas they control without having significant political connections.

Leaving the gangs is incredibly challenging. A person who is in a gang’s outer ring, running errands or occasionally holding a weapon, could possibly withdraw and return to ‘civilian life.’ However, leaving the gangs would be extremely difficult for a soldier, and virtually impossible for a chef. The only way they could leave the gangs would be by leaving Cité Soleil, preferably also leaving Port au Prince, or Haiti. The few powerful chimè who tried to return to civilian life in Cité Soleil were assassinated, because other gangsters felt threatened by their former power. So for most soldiers and chef, there is no exit strategy except for death or prison.

**Age and Social Determinants of Gang Membership in Cité Soleil**

Youth are an important part of the political and militarized space in Haiti. Young people have been at the forefront of the political movements that led up to the end of the Duvalier regime,
the coup d’états of Aristide, and everything in between. The average age of an armed urban gang member is 22, and the average age of other insurgency group members is 26.

The mechanisms that the community’s adults would use to control youth have broken down: urban migration has eroded many of the traditional community mechanisms for social order. In addition, so few parents are able to adequately provide for the basic needs of their households (food, shelter, safety, education) that many have lost their moral authority over their children. Some families even depend on their children's gang-related activities for their livelihood or safety.

The reasons young people join gangs are complex: one of the primary reasons is that being a part of a gang, and being armed, gives them a feeling of control over a very chaotic existence. Violence in Haiti falls disproportionally on people living in the poorest neighborhoods, and domestic abuse is prevalent. One study showed that every person in Cité Soleil knew someone who was a victim of violence. Joining a gang - or being in the good graces of a gang - provides a sense of security.

Cité Soleil youth also feel socially excluded and marginalized. They are aware that their poor living conditions are not normal, and of how the rest of the country sees them. They see violence as a legitimate way to gain social respect, fight exclusion, and set the score with those in power.

This social exclusion increases youth’s chances of unemployment. Social mobility opportunities are very limited in neighborhoods like Cité Soleil, as is access to education. On average, gang members have only 7 years of education, which is not enough to graduate secondary school. Being from Cité Soleil carries such a strong stigma that even those who are qualified for jobs may be disqualified on the spot.

Due to the lasting insecurity few private enterprises are willing to invest in Cité Soleil. Many young people feel that if the public and private sectors aren’t willing to give them a chance, they will ‘take matters into their own hands’. Gang association is one of the few existing income opportunities in Cité Soleil. Gangs gain money through illegal activities, as well use political connections to control access to legitimate jobs and professional development opportunities.

**Community-Gang Relations**

The gangs have a complex relationship with the communities they are from. Many armed young people, and unarmed residents, see the gangs as a necessary form of protection on many levels. Because of the lack of trust in the police, many communities rely on gangs to protect them from thieves and other gangs. Some communities will even pressure local unarmed baz to take up arms, citing their responsibility to protect the neighborhood. Other gang members are more militant and see themselves at war with those in power, including the political and economic
elite, the police, and even MINUSTAH. Many armed youth cite a desire to serve their community as their main reason for joining a gang.

Given this, there is an unwritten social contract between neighborhoods and their local gangs. There are informal "rules" for gang behavior, including who they can target to kill (other gangsters, gangsters' family and girlfriends, politicians, and thieves.) Women are generally considered neutral and not direct targets of gangs (although there are high rates of domestic and sexual violence in Cité Soleil.) If the gangs protect the neighborhood against thieves, and follow the "rules", then the community will allow them to operate and even protect them against arrest by the police or MINUSTAH. But if a gangster gets out of control, the neighborhood may try to cooperate with the police or MINUSTAH for their arrest, recruit a rival gang to run them out, or even kill the gangsters themselves. While this is rare, it does happen when the community is pushed past its breaking point.

However, despite this unspoken arrangement, the gangs regularly abuse their power. They divert many local resources for their own gain, endanger their communities through battles with other gangs or police/MINUSTAH, use their weapons to settle personal grievances over pride or women, and are often hostile to other forms of local leadership. Much of the violence that residents experience is directly related to the gangs.

The younger generation of gangsters is less powerful but more unpredictable; many of them seem to disregard the "rules" of the past and have been known to beat women and children just for looking at them the wrong way. Recently, one opened fire on a crowd of several thousand at a street party - this was unheard of even in the "bad years" of 2004-2006. Locals estimate that between 12 to 27 people were killed.

**The State**

Underlying all of this is the real and perceived absence of the Haitian state. There is extremely low confidence in the justice system: the police are seen as very corrupt and have been involved in many criminal activities such as kidnapping, rape, and other abuses of power. Most people in Cité Soleil simply do not see it as a viable option to go to the police, which is why they turn to local gangs for justice and protection. When people do go to the police, they are often asked to hand bribes in order for an arrest to be made, and even when this happens, criminals are frequently released. This makes people reluctant to engage with the police for fear of retribution. The rest of the justice system is seen as equally corrupt, with bribes and favors being the primary determinants of rulings.

There is great distrust of the government: a post-earthquake survey showed that only 15% of residents thought that the government was doing a good job, and only 9% thought it was honest
and fair. Basic services such as electricity, trash collection, water, sanitation, road maintenance, and education are unreliable or non-existent, and if they are present, it is often because an NGO or UN group is financing it. Many residents feel that the local government has an incentive to keep Cité Soleil impoverished, because the officials profit from projects designed to fix the municipality’s problems. In the absence of the government, gangs function as a substitute state in many neighborhoods.

There are many allegations of local and national politicians directly supporting local gangs with financing, guns, and ammunition, in addition to providing immunity when necessary. This is why even being associated with politics (being an abolocho; an intermediary between politicians and gangs or groups of young people) can make someone a ‘justifiable’ gang target.

**International Intervention**

Between 2004 and 2006, the gangs had complete control over Cité Soleil and there was virtually no state presence. In 2007, the Preval government made it a priority to regain control over the area, and authorized a MINUSTAH/police intervention. Soleil became a virtual war zone, with tanks in the streets, helicopters in the air, and barricades at the entries to the area. While some reports describe this intervention as sensitive and cautious, many residents remember the time as terrifying and deadly, with many civilian casualties and disproportionate use of force. After many months of fighting, most of the major gang leaders were imprisoned, killed, or exiled, and the state regained some control.

A ‘window of opportunity’ for creating peace dividends and re-establishing the legitimacy of the state was opened, and largely missed. Despite several ‘quick win’ projects, local residents’ expectations of the return of the state and the private sector to Cité Soleil went unrealized. This not only created great cynicism among local residents, but also meant that the underlying factors that led to the creation of gangs went unresolved. Therefore, the post-2007 reduction in gang activity was temporary. By 2013, the percentage of youth involved in gangs was about the same as it was between 2004 and 2005.

MINUSTAH’s post-2007 disarmament programs were also problematic: their incentives were too weak to convince most gang members to transition to a civilian life, but were strong enough to convince some unarmed young people to buy arms just to benefit from their services. After it failed to succeed, the DDR program became the Community Violence Reduction (CVR) program. MINUSTAH soldiers are still present and patrolling in Cité Soleil, and their militarized presence is resented by many residents, who see it as a foreign occupying force and a symbol of foreign intervention in Haiti.
The post-2007 period was also a time when many international NGOs began operating in Cité Soleil. While there were some positive initiatives, as a whole, NGO interventions failed to ‘add up’ to lasting peace and NGO operations may often have contributed to violence. Many NGOs operated through local gangsters, which reinforced their power. Many residents felt alienated and excluded by the politics of relief and lack of communication. Some jobs related to NGO projects were disruptive because they caused a lot of competition and did not last long; ‘cash for work’ projects were notoriously corrupt.

Between 2007 and 2010, the international community spent more than $100 million in Cité Soleil; much more has been spent since the earthquake. Many locals know this and yet see no change, and therefore assume that NGOs are exploiting their poverty for personal gain. This has led to an attitude of “mutual exploitation:” when residents feel that NGOs are taking advantage of them, they take advantage of the NGOs by stealing project resources and sabotaging the project. When there is trust between an NGO and a community, however, residents will actively take risks to protect the project.

**Daily Life and Civil Society**

Despite all of these dynamics, life goes on in Cité Soleil. Without the factories, most families depend on the informal markets for their livelihoods; very few people have formal jobs. The economic heart of Cité Soleil is the Brooklyn market, followed by the Bwa Nef market, both of which attract people from neighborhoods across the municipality. Because Cité Soleil borders the sea, there is a substantial fishing population in neighborhoods along the water. Neighborhoods that border National Highway #1 have bigger businesses, like commercial depots and wholesalers. There are still some factories, where people work for very low wages that provide some stable form of employment.

There has recently been some minor economic investment in various parts of the municipality by some progressive members of the elite class and by emerging social enterprises.

Because there is so little economic opportunity in Cité Soleil, there is an intense focus on education as the path to a better life. Families make great sacrifices to send their children to school, and will even send them to neighborhoods that are considered ‘rival territories’ if necessary. Schools and after-school activities are also seen as important for keeping young people ‘off the streets’ and make them less vulnerable to involvement with gangs. However, Cité Soleil has only two state-run schools (one primary, one secondary) and both were severely damaged in the earthquake. So most families either have to pay tuition for private schools that, have varying quality of instruction, or give up on schooling entirely.
For the people who succeed at school and find employment, there is intense pressure to leave Cité Soleil. There is a perception that the only people who live in Cité Soleil are those that have no other choice, and residents are suspicious of successful neighbors who remain in the area. This has created a ‘brain drain’ out of Cité Soleil, and resulted in a significant number of local Diaspora, known as Soley Deyò. While many are ashamed of their origins (and many others exploit their connections to Cité Soleil for political gain), there is a growing number of former residents (including famous ones such as the international boxer Evens Paul) who are trying to positively engage the area.

For those that remain behind, geography is identity. The geographic nature of the gang conflicts creates lines that many residents feel uncomfortable crossing. This isolation has led to an intense sense of neighborhood identity and pride. This sense of pride motivates many baz to name their neighborhoods after big cities; e.g. Los Angeles, Paris, and Jerusalem are three neighborhoods that border each other. Baz are competitive about who has the best area: this can be healthy when it motivates young people to invest their energy and resources into their neighborhoods. However, this competitiveness can also get out of hand and lead to inter-neighborhood conflict.

The dominance of young men is clear in the Cité Soleil culture. A globalized urban culture has taken hold in the area, with hip-hop, break-dancing, graffiti, and street parties being very important. Local DJs are influential figures, because bringing a popular DJ to a street party is a measure of a baz’s resources and connections. Sports such as basketball and football (soccer) are extremely popular, although they are played less during times of increased violence. Excelling in one of these areas is one of the few ways to earn some respect in Cité Soleil without being involved with gangs or politics.

Religion also plays a role in the lives of many in Cité Soleil: residents generally practice Voudou, Catholicism, or one of many Protestant denominations. Some religious leaders are respected and active community organizers, others are suspected of corruption or political links. Various churches and temples may draw people of the same faith together from across the municipality, but not across faiths. There are no active inter-religious forums to coordinate between faith leaders in Cité Soleil. However, during certain times of crisis, local activists have managed to mobilize religious leaders to participate in movements such as peace marches and other displays of unity.

Civil society also plays a role in Cité Soleil: there is a countless number of informal local associations and registered organizations. Many of these have been providing services to their communities for years. However, many others are seen as "pocket organizations" (which their leaders will "pull out of their pockets" when NGOs or other funding sources are around, but are otherwise not active in the community.) The latter has seriously delegitimized the former, to the
point where there is suspicion of even legitimate local groups. The use of some local associations as "middlemen" for politicians further undermines civil society's legitimacy.

In general, the media is seen as another force that exploits Cité Soleil's misery for its own financial benefit. Residents are very suspicious of anyone with a camera: it is assumed that foreigners taking pictures will use the images of Cité Soleil's poverty as a way to raise funds for projects that will never benefit Cité Soleil. There is one community radio station in Cité Soleil called Radio Boukman, which is generally appreciated by local residents, although the founder was assassinated by gangs in 2013. Most Soleyans get their local news from Teledjòl, the rumors that circulate constantly around Cité Soleil. While they are important for survival, rumors can easily spiral out of control and result in conflict or death.

**Post-Earthquake Conflict and Opportunities**

The earthquake of January 12, 2010 was a shock to the entire country, but its effects in Cité Soleil were not what was covered in the media. The national prison was destroyed in the earthquake, releasing thousands of prisoners, many of which were gang members that communities helped to arrest, and came back to terrorize their old neighborhoods. New struggles emerged as boundaries of gang territories were disrupted by the disaster and ex-prisoners sought to re-establish their power.

The camp for displaced persons in Cité Soleil’s central square, Place Fierite, became a source of insecurity because thieves and unruly gangsters could hide in the tent camp instead of being accountable to their neighborhoods. The situation was so bad that an ad-hoc coalition of baz eventually evacuated and burned down the camp in a single night in October 2010.

The government, police, and MINUSTAH had all been badly affected by the earthquake and were already stretched thin with the response. This led to further reduction in state presence and services that created a void that the gangs filled. Many gangs profited from dealing with corrupt NGO and government workers who controlled relief resources.

As a result levels of insecurity and gang membership, which had been declining since 2007, increased sharply in the post-earthquake period.

However, the post-earthquake period also brought together many unarmed civil society groups who felt motivated by the disaster. A social movement was established in 2011 called Konbit Soley Leve, which sought to bring people from different neighborhoods together to address common problems such as flooded canals, trash, blackouts, and at-risk youth. It was an unstructured, unofficial, open movement with no fixed leadership. The movement’s structure was designed to make it impossible for it to receive money, cooperate with politicians, or ignite
fights over control. The movement grew over the next few years until it had participants from across Cité Soleil, and has gone through various cycles of visible activity (such as leading a peace march that ended a conflict between Cité Soleil and the area of Simon-Pele) and more underground activity (during times when social leaders are being targeted.)

2014 saw the re-emergence of the conflict between 'Upper' and 'Lower' Cité Soleil, which is separated by the Route 9 highway. This conflict has historical, political, and class aspects: Upper Cité Soleil is all housing projects, whereas Lower Cité Soleil is a mixture of housing projects and slums. These zones have also traditionally had differing political allegiances. The battle has recently reignited, and even unarmed civilians have been targeted and killed for being in the wrong territory at the wrong time. The conflict has escalated through tit-for-tat killings, and has gotten to the point where few people will cross Route 9. This poses a new challenge for everyone operating in Cité Soleil.

References

Several sources were reviewed in compiling this case study. Facilitators can make this list available to participants and should familiarize themselves with some of these sources.


Below is a map of Cité Soleil, divided into 10 neighborhoods. Note: the boundaries of these blocks are not official, and different groups have different interpretations of the borders and names. Route 9, that divides Upper and Lower Cité Soleil is represented by the dotted line. Everything to the left of the dotted line is lower Cité Soleil, and everything to the right of the dotted line is Upper Cité Soleil.

Waf Jeremi is not pictured on the map but is due South of Belekou. It is not directly involved in the current conflict.

Map 3: Cité Soleil from Google Maps at [www.google.com/maps](http://www.google.com/maps) adapted by CDA.
Do No Harm Analysis

After the introduction, the facilitator should write “The Conflict” on a board and ask participants to identify the existing conflicts in this scenario. This list should include:

- Intra-gang conflict,
- Inter-gang conflict,
- Gang vs. police and MINUSTAH,
- Gang vs. community members, and
- Community members vs. police and MINUSTAH.

Dividers

Then, underneath to the right, write “Dividers,” and ask participants to name the sources of tension and division in Cité Soleil. Give the participants about 15 minutes to brainstorm their ideas. Encourage them to draw lessons from the text and question each others' assumptions. This list should include:

- Geographic divisions, (e.g. Upper vs. Lower Cité Soleil, rival neighborhoods, etc.)
- Lack of economic opportunity/competition for jobs,
- Inter-neighborhood competition, enhanced by neighborhoods’ isolation,
- Gang power and privilege,
- Gangsters as "gatekeepers" of opportunity, and resentment of unarmed youth,
- Gangsters breaking "the rules," especially younger gangsters,
- Undermining of local civil society,
- Political manipulation of the community,
- Distrust of NGOs,
- Distrust of politicians and local government,
- Lack of state services and infrastructure,
- Distrust of MINUSTAH, the police, and the justice system,
- Distrust of the media,
- Class divisions,
- Different livelihoods,
- Political divisions,
- Religious differences, and
- Stigma of being from Cité Soleil.
**Optional: Finding Patterns**

Once a good list has been generated, the trainer can ask the participants to look at the list as a whole and search for patterns, "What do you see in these tensions? Any patterns? Any common features? Any important differences?" Understanding the broader patterns in these dividers can provide additional insight that can be used for program planning.

The group may note that the vast majority of the tensions relate to distrust that comes from real experiences (and the perceptions/interpretations of those experiences) over the past twenty years. Even after the war-like situation of 2004-2006, Cité Soleil’s residents have been continually exposed to trauma that makes them feel as if they have little control over their lives: peacekeepers who don’t speak their language raid their communities, police arrest friends and family members when there is no functioning justice system that will release the innocent, gangsters decide who lives and who dies, etc. This trauma creates extremely high levels of distrust within the population, and it will almost always assume the worst out of an attempt to protect itself.

**Connectors**

On the right side of the board, the trainer should write “Connectors.” Then ask the participants about the sources of connection in Cité Soleil, “What connects the residents of Cité Soleil? What are shared values, experiences, community structures that could be a source of connection/unity?” This list should include:

- Schools and the value of education,
- Public markets,
- Health centers/hospitals,
- Community radio station,
- Self-reliance/self-organization, (baz)
- Sense of responsibility that some of the gangs have towards their neighborhood,
- Gang "rules",
- Women considered neutral,
- Community mobilization in times of crises,
- Population’s desire for safety,
- Some legitimate civil society,
- Shared problems: trash, flooding, blackouts, etc.
- Shared activities: street parties, sports, etc.
- Shared culture: graffiti, hip-hop, etc.
- Neighborhood pride transformed into “Soleyan Pride,”
• Value of "keeping young people out of trouble," and
• Faith or religion unifying across geographic lines within a single faith.

Optional: Finding Patterns

After this discussion, the trainer can ask participants to reflect on these connecting factors, "What do you see in these connectors? Any patterns? Any common features? Any important differences?" Understanding the broader patterns in these connectors can provide additional insight that can be used for program planning.

One possible pattern is that shared spaces (like schools and markets) will have a direct impact on how the project is planned. Another could be that shared culture and activities will have more implications for how the NGO builds trust. There could also be an interesting conversation about identity and neighborhood pride, and whether they can be turned into a broader Cité Soleil pride and sense of identity?

However, one of the most important patterns that appears in the connectors is having shared problems: insecurity, thieves, trash, blackouts, lack of services, stigma. These problems are universal across all neighborhoods, and participants shouldn't underestimate the power of helping people realize their shared challenges.
Drivers of Conflict Analysis

In this section, participants will discuss the key factors driving the conflict, and local capacities for peace. Note that there are five major conflicts in this context:

1. Intra-gang conflicts,
2. Inter-gang conflicts,
3. Gangs vs. police and MINUSTAH,
4. Gangs vs. community members, and
5. Community members vs. police and MINUSTAH.

This analysis will mainly focus on conflicts between gangs and community members, and conflicts between or within gangs that affect unarmed community members. Local residents generally do not care if a gang member has been killed unless there is a repercussion for the neighborhood.

Factors Against Peace

First, describe the difference between key driving factors, proximate factors, (or triggers) and root causes. **Key driving factors** are elements without which the conflict would either not exist or be totally different. **Proximate factors**, or triggers, are events and factors that push the conflict to the point of violence. **Root causes** are important to understanding the population's vulnerability to the key driving factors, and help us understand the root causes of the conflict.

Here are some helpful distinctions to start off with: Someone may say that poverty is a key driving factor, but if that were true, why aren't there gangs in poor rural Haiti? Unemployed youth in rural Haiti can make ends meet through alternative means of livelihood such as agriculture. However, poor urban unemployed youth **don’t have other livelihood options**. Therefore, poverty in Cité Soleil is more a root cause of conflict than a key driving factor. Similarly, **political crisis** is a trigger rather than a key driving factor. The gangs and the conflicts they are involved would still exist if there were no political crises. Nonetheless, a political crisis can be a trigger event that brings the conflict to violence.

Key driving factors must be measurable: you should be able to see whether they are getting better or worse. That doesn’t mean they have to be quantifiable in numbers or that you have existing data, but if hypothetically you asked someone in the area, they should be able to tell you whether the factor is increasing or decreasing.
After introducing those terms, ask participants to identify the **key driving factors** behind the five conflicts listed above. Make sure that the following factors are discussed:

- Urban youth unemployment level,
- Degree and frequency of political manipulation of Cité Soleil youth,
- Amount of guns, ammunition, and financing provided to local gangs by their patrons,
- Amount of prestige and power that gang leaders accrue, (and is validated by those in power)
- Degree of social marginalization/exclusion from Haitian society,
- Level of daily violence and crime in Cité Soleil, and inability of the state to protect the population from it, and
- Level of moral authority of parents and the community over vulnerable youth.

Then, ask participants to identify some of the **root causes** that explain the context in which the key driving factors have power. Make sure that the following root causes are discussed:

- Poverty, urbanization, overcrowding,
- ‘Brain drain’: educated or successful Soleyans leaving the area,
- Classism and racism/ structural violence,
- Lack of state services and private sector investment,
- Corruption and failed governance,
- History of foreign intervention,
- Counterproductive NGO practices,
- Failure of DDR measures,
- Militarized MINUSTAH presence,
- Post-earthquake release of prisoners,
- Collective trauma, from: daily violence, political violence, natural disasters, etc.
- Stigma and internalization of stigma, and
- Climate of distrust and suspicion.

Lastly, ask participants what are potential **proximate causes**, or trigger events, that could bring the conflict to the point of violence. Make sure that the following proximate causes are discussed:

- Political crises or events, especially elections,
- Rumors, (*Teledjòl*)
- Power shifts within or between gangs,
- Inter-personal conflicts, (jealousy, competition over women, insults, etc.)
- Inter-neighborhood competition,
- Competition over economic opportunities, (jobs, cash for work, etc.)
• Natural disasters, rising food prices, and other factors that strain daily life, and
• Police and MINUSTAH raids.

Now, ask the participants to brainstorm key actors that are working against positive changes for peace. Participants should identify what the actors are doing that puts them in opposition to positive changes, in addition to listing the actors. Encourage the participants to consider who is benefitting from the current status quo. Make sure that the following actors are mentioned:

• The political and economic elite who act as patrons to the local gangs,
• Middlemen between the political and economic elite and the gangs, (Abolocho)
• Local elected officials who support or tolerate local gangs,
• Corrupt Haitian National Police officers who participate in criminal activities,
• MINUSTAH soldiers that abuse their power,
• Chef and soldiers of local gangs,
• Baz who accept political patronage and support local gangs,
• Community leaders who support local gangs, and
• NGOs that legitimize local gangs or deepen divisions in the neighborhoods.

Factors for Peace

Ask participants what are key factors for peace in Cité Soleil. These are factors that contribute to the population's resiliency to violence, and also actively contribute to the potential for peace. Like key drivers of conflict, factors for peace should be measurable over time as increasing or decreasing. Make sure that the following factors are mentioned:

• Level of inter-neighborhood connectivity and solidarity, (e.g. the Soley Leve movement)
• Number of activities that foster inter-neighborhood connection, (sports, culture, volunteering)
• Strength of community's ability to exert influence over gang behavior,
• Level of local gangs' adherence to social contract,
• Desire of young people (including those in gangs) to protect and serve their communities,
• Level of investment in the youth of Cité Soleil, (education, schools, professional training)
• Number of sustainable livelihoods that don’t depend on crime or political patronage, and
• Degree of social integration and acceptance of Soleyans in certain sectors.

The participants should then discuss the key actors that work towards peace/positive change, and the actions/behaviors that contribute to peace:

• Community leaders who are independent of politicians or gangs, (Soley Leve, religious leaders, local associations, etc.)
• Local DJs, musicians, and athletes who use their talents to bring neighborhoods together,
• Progressive economic elite who is investing in Cité Soleil,
• Cité Soleil ‘diaspora’ who engages their former home,
• Local media that highlights different (not only violent) narratives about Cité Soleil,
• NGOs/UN groups that are working in a conflict-sensitive way, and
• Government workers who actually provide the services they are mandated to.
Main Scenario

You are one of several organizations working in Cité Soleil. Below is a description of your mandate, experience, and capacity:

**United Nations Community Violence Reduction (CVR) Unit**

After its unsuccessful DDR efforts, MINUSTAH formed the CVR unit to work on new approaches to violence reduction. Your mandate is very clearly to prevent future violence and support rule of law. You have done this through a variety of programs, including professional education programs, disarmament incentive programs, dialogue programs, and infrastructure projects. You are a donor and a policy-maker and rarely act as a direct service-provider. You have a substantial budget that comes with politically driven spending constraints.

**The Mayor of Cité Soleil**

After the elected mayor of Cité Soleil recently resigned, you were appointed as Mayor by the president. You lived in Cité Soleil as a child, but your family moved away in 2004 when the violence got very bad. You still live outside of Cité Soleil. You have authority over other government actors in your area, including the local police, water services, and sanitation services. You have a very limited budget: the lack of private sector investment in Cité Soleil means you have very little tax revenue and are financially dependent on the central government and NGOs. You would like to create more security to encourage investment, but you are unsure of how long you will be in office. Elections could happen in one month or not for another year.

**Dialogue International Peacebuilding NGO 1**

You are an NGO based in Ireland, which worked on peacebuilding through dialogue and trauma healing during Ireland’s civil strife. You were so successful in your country that after the violence ended, you decided to take your approach abroad to help other countries resolve civil conflict. You have been working in other communities affected by violence in Port au Prince for the past few years, and are interested in expanding your work to Cité Soleil. You recently got a grant to run a dialogue program in Cité Soleil.

**Negotiation International Peacebuilding NGO 2**

You are an NGO based in Honduras, with a peacebuilding mandate. You have been working on gang violence reduction programs in the slums of Honduras’ capital. Your approach has been to negotiate peace deals between gangs and law enforcement, and provide incentives for them to stay within the bounds of the peace processes. Some of those incentives have included giving cooperating gangs access to jobs and job training programs. You recently received a grant to replicate your approach in Cité Soleil.
**Inter-Faith International** Peacebuilding NGO 3
You are an NGO with a background in encouraging inter-faith peacebuilding. Your mandate is to leverage the moral authority of faith leaders to gain their communities buy-in for your peacebuilding projects. You have worked in many post-conflict settings throughout the world, but never in a situation of chronic urban violence. Your organization was invited by Norwegian Church Aid to Port au Prince for an exploratory visit, and is interested in beginning to work in Cité Soleil.

**Global Accountability Network** Human Rights NGO
You are an international collective of human rights lawyers which has an office in Port au Prince. Your mandate is to increase accountability, rule of law, and systemic change, by helping vulnerable populations access the justice system. You have had bad experiences dealing with local government and MINUSTAH (the latter from trying to take them to court over their introduction of cholera into the country.) The recent rise in civilian killings in Cité Soleil has caught your attention, and you are wondering how to encourage people to hold someone accountable for the lack of security.

**Rebuild Haiti** Development NGO
You are a well-known Haitian NGO that operates across the country doing construction and engineering projects. You have been busy since the earthquake, because you have anti-seismic engineers on staff. You were recently given a damage assessment of buildings across Cité Soleil, including schools, churches, a hospital, market infrastructure, and a local police station. You've never worked in Cité Soleil before, but have funding for building rehabilitation and have been encouraged to work in this marginalized area. What buildings and geographic locations would you work in, and how given the current conflict?

**Freedom Phone Foundation** Corporate Foundation
You are a large telecommunications company in Haiti. You have a lot of infrastructure (mostly signal towers) in Cité Soleil because real-estate is cheap, and are concerned that increasing violence and lawlessness would harm your investments. So you told your Foundation to carry out projects in the area that will build good will towards the company and improve the security situation in the areas where you have infrastructure. (Boston, Cite Lumiere, and Bwa Nef)

**Youth Unite!** Local Organization 1
You are a local, registered NGO that was founded in 2006 to provide services to young people in Cité Soleil who were affected by violence. Your mandate is to help young people stay away from
the local gangs, mostly by creating a “safe space” where kids from all across Cité Soleil can get together, play sports, and do homework. You provide services to about 500 young people, but are running on a shoe-string budget. Most of your staff is from Cité Soleil, and the recent conflict has made it hard for staff and kids from Lower Cité Soleil to make it to your facility in Upper Cité Soleil.

**Bwa Nef Development Association Local Organization 2**

You are an unregistered, local association in Bwa Nef that has been working since the earthquake. You create socio-cultural and educational activities in your neighborhood for young people and the whole community. You have no budget except for neighborhood contributions, but you have a lot of social capital because people enjoy your activities. All of your members live in the community, so you have to be very careful about not upsetting the local gangsters. Your association recently had a day of reflection to think about how much you were actually contributing to peace in the neighborhood, and you are thinking about how (with your limited resources) you can work better at making your neighborhood a safer place.

*Note: with the exception of UNCVR and the Mayor’s office, all of these organizations are fictional. Some are loosely based on real organizations, but details have been changed or invented for the sake of this case study.*
Program Analysis

Break participants into small groups and assign each group one of the organizations from the previous section. Each group should then take a specified amount of time to develop a robust goal and a theory of change.

Participants should then discuss their projects by doing critical detail mapping. Here are some key questions:

Who are we working with?

- Who are we hiring? Who are we not hiring? Why?
- Will we work with gangsters? Why or why not?
- What kinds of groups will we partner with? What criteria will we have about who to partner with?
- Are we working with the local government? The police? MINUSTAH? Why or why not?
- Who are our intended beneficiaries? Why?
- Are we leaving anyone out? What impact could that have?

Where are we working?

- What communities are we choosing to work in?
- Why are we working in this particular neighborhood?
- Given the geographic nature of the conflict, what impact might this have?

What are we doing?

- Is the intervention type appropriate for the context?
- What else could we be doing that we are not?
- What other kinds of interventions like ours have taken place before? Did they go well?
- What are we expecting from our community partners?
- What could go wrong?

When is our intervention taking place?

- Are we arriving at an appropriate time? How would we know?
- What kinds of events could affect how good our timing is? (elections, outbreaks of violence, natural disasters, etc.)
- What is the pace at which we should be working? Why?
- Do we have an exit strategy?
- Does the timing of our intervention exclude anyone?
How are we doing what we are doing?

- How will we communicate with the community we are working in? How will we involve them in our decisions?
- How will we select beneficiaries?
- How will we hire workers?
- How will we keep our staff safe?

Why are we doing what we are doing?

- Why do we think our Theory of Change is correct?
- Why us? Do we have the appropriate skills and expertise?

Participants should then work to plot their projects onto the Change Matrix. While there may be some variation depending on how people understand their activities, in general, organizations should fall in the following boxes:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>More People</th>
<th>Key People</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Individual Change</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dialogue International</td>
<td>Interfaith International</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Youth Unite!</td>
<td>Negotiation International</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bwa Nef Development Association</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Socio-Political Change</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rebuild Haiti</td>
<td>UNCVR</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Freedom Phone Foundation</td>
<td>Global Accountability Network</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Mayor of Cité Soleil</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Addressing Key Driving Factors

Each of these organizations’ mandates can be interpreted in a way that allows them to address Key Driving Factors, whether or not their mandate includes “peacebuilding.” Have each group think of ways their organization could work to address a key driving factor. Here are some examples:

- **UNCVR** could work to reduce the political manipulation of the youth of Cité Soleil, and the transfer of weapons and resources to them.
- **The Mayor’s Office** could work with police to increase their ability to protect the community from violence.
- **Dialogue International** could use dialogue to address social marginalization and exclusion.
- **Negotiation International** could use negotiation to reduce the daily violence and crime.
- **Global Accountability Network** could use the power of the law to address political manipulation.
- **Interfaith International** could work to reduce the prestige that gang leaders accrue, by strengthening faith leaders and other non-violent community leaders.
- **Freedom Phone Foundation** could help reduce the level of youth unemployment by investing in job training programs or trying to create employment opportunities within the parent company.
- **Rebuild Haiti** could reduce unemployment by training youth in anti-seismic construction.
- **Youth Unite!** could increase parents’ and communities’ level of moral authority, by partnering with them to create safe spaces and opportunities for young people.
- **Bwa Nef Development Association** could increase parents’ and communities’ level of moral authority, by partnering with them to create safe spaces and opportunities for young people.
Organizational Impacts Discussion

**Actions**

Give each group this series of questions that examines possible impacts of their organization’s actions on connectors and dividers:

**UNCVR Substitution**

- With your actions to "stabilize" the government, how do you ensure that you are not substituting for the government?
- If you want to avoid substitution and work with the government, how do you deal with the fact that much of the population does not see the state as legitimate?
- MINUSTAH’s mandate is up for renewal every year: if the mandate is not renewed next year, will the program be sustainable?
- How would perceived substitution impact the effectiveness of your program?

**Mayor of Cité Soleil Theft**

Your budget is often not enough to pay municipal workers, and so many of them steal Cité Soleil project funds or resources.

- How do you address this if and when it happens, especially given that you cannot guarantee the workers a fair salary?
- What impact does this theft have on the legitimacy and effectiveness of your program?

**Dialogue International Legitimization**

- You cannot invite everyone to a dialogue session, how do you decide who to invite?
- If you invite controversial people such as gangsters or politicians, do you run the risk of legitimizing them?
- Many armed actors in Cité Soleil are used to going to dialogues meetings, saying the right thing in front of foreigners, and then continuing the status quo after the NGO leaves. This increases community cynicism and distrust. How do you ensure you are not just providing them a platform to make false promises?

**Negotiation International Legitimization**

- Your program provides incentives to gangsters who adhere to the peace accords, but does not involve benefits for non-violent civilians. Could this be seen as rewarding armed actors and ignoring/punishing non-violent civilians?
• Who do you involve in the peace accords? By inviting groups who have illegitimate power to the negotiating table, are you legitimizing their power?
• How could your program be altered to avoid legitimizing actors who are seen as illegitimate in the community? Or is legitimization of armed actors a necessary price to pay for these peace deals?

**Inter-faith International** Distribution

• You can only work with so many faith leaders and so many faiths at one time. How do you select which faith leaders to work with?
• How could the geographic distribution of who you work with affect the perception of your work?
• Voudou temples tend to be less structured and harder to work with than hierarchical churches. How could the distribution of which faiths you work with affect the perception of your work?

**Global Accountability Network** Substitution

There are branches of the Haitian government that are supposed to be advocating for the protection of civilians (Ministries that deal with civil protection, child wellbeing, women's rights, etc.) and their legal rights (including a program called *Kay Jistis* or 'House of Justice'.)

• How can you ensure that your work isn't substituting for these government actors and 'letting them off the hook' by doing their work for them?
• What effects could this have on the sustainability of your initiative?
• How do you balance the need to avoid substitution effects with the fact that many people simply don't trust the government and won't access legal services if they have to go through state functionaries?

**Rebuild Haiti** Market

Because you are a construction NGO, you need to consider a lot about the effects of your work on local markets.

• Where will you buy your materials: locally or outside of Cité Soleil? What are the advantages and disadvantages of each decision?
• Where will you hire your workers: locally or outside of Cité Soleil? What are the advantages and disadvantages of each decision?
• How could your market decisions lead to conflict, and how could you minimize that?

**Freedom Phone Foundation** Distribution
• Considering your program is focused in three neighborhoods (two in Upper Cité Soleil and one in Lower Cité Soleil), how will the geographic distribution of your program be perceived?
• How could the geographic distribution of your work lead to conflict?
• How could you mitigate that?

Youth Unite! Market

Assuming that whatever you provide to young people (books, school uniforms, basketballs, tutoring lessons) for free is also being sold in the neighborhood these young people come from:

• What impacts could your program have on the markets in the neighborhood these young people come from?
• How could you alter your program to minimize the negative market effects your program may have, and maximize the positive effects it could have?

Bwa Nef Development Association Theft

• If you are working with a partner that provides you with materials or funds, how can you ensure that those goods are not stolen by local gangs?
• What harm could come to your members if you tried to prevent the gangs from stealing project goods?
• If you can't prevent theft of materials by local gangs, how would you alter your program to minimize the risk of theft and harm to your members?

Behaviors

Next, ask the groups to discuss how their organization’s behaviors might have an impact on the dividers and connectors in the conflict. One scenario can be discussed by all groups and reactions shared in plenary, or different scenarios can be assigned to different groups:

Scenario 1 Transparency

You received a grant from a large multilateral donor. During the project planning stages, your field staff comes to you and explains that this particular donor has a bad reputation in Cité Soleil, and many people feel that the donor is politically aligned with the economic elite. The last project this donor funded was burned to the ground, and staff were harassed. Your staff does not want to disclose the project’s donor to the community because they fear for their own safety. How do you balance transparency with safety, and what should you do?

Considerations:
• You have a responsibility for your staff’s safety. However, if the community finds out you kept this information from them it could undermine their confidence in you and jeopardize the project and your staff.

Possible action: Negotiate with your donor to avoid the use of any prominent logos on the staff or site. But you can still inform key community contacts about the donor’s identity and be honest when asked. Use that conversation as an opportunity to explain more about the project and how it can be different from past projects that the community had bad experiences with.

Scenario 2 Fairness

You want to provide as many local jobs as possible through your project, so you announce that you will be hiring about 30 local people to do various kinds of work related to the project. You circulate an application form and plan to interview candidates at the end of the week. A few days later, a group of young people from the local gang show up with guns and demand that you hire them. They threaten that unless some of their people get hired, your project won’t be safe anymore. What do you do? How can you be fair and keep your project safe?

Considerations

• You are concerned for the safety of your staff.
• Giving in to the demands of these young men further legitimizes them and their tactics.
• It may also encourage others to come forward and try to use threats to get hired.
• It could also discourage the people who are going through the legitimate hiring process.
• You don’t want to categorically deny these men access to the jobs, because they are also members of the community, and most of them are very poor.

Possible action: Tell the young people that they are welcome to apply for the job like any other community member, but that you are not responsible for the hiring. You can even say you couldn’t hire them even if you wanted to, because an impartial committee at headquarters looks at the application. They can apply, and if you evaluate applications without the names, and one happens to earn his place based on the application, then he earned his place.

Scenario 3 Respect

You get a call from one of your field staff, and he is angry. He says that a significant piece of equipment has gone missing. Right after he hangs up, you get a call from one of your community contacts, who is also angry - she says that your staff accused some local people of stealing the equipment, and that they are insulted that he would make such an accusation. How do you prevent theft, and mitigate this conflict in a manner that is respectful of your community partners and contractors?
Considerations:

- This is a situation where trust can easily break - both parties (the contractor and the community partner) feel that their trust was violated.
- Don't presume guilt on the community's part, but also don't minimize the concerns of the contractor. Give both parties the time to express themselves.
- Be wary of assumptions that will be made based on class/social status.
- Emphasize connectors, in this case: the shared vision of completing the project.
- Thieves are clearly a large point of contention in the community - be aware that being accused of robbery has serious consequences.

Scenario 4 Accountability

You are busy preparing for the inauguration of your project tomorrow, and everyone is very excited. You’ve planned for a big party with music and performances from local youth and speeches from community leaders and other public figures. Timing is perfect, because your final report to the donor is due in two days, and this is the last event you need (along with the receipts, photos, etc.) to submit your report. Then, at 9:00 at night, you get a call from your community contact. She says that tonight there was a party on the other side of Cité Soleil, and that gangs from their side had gone in and opened fire. Two dozen civilians were killed, and a few gangsters. She is worried that there will be a reprisal attack on the inauguration party tomorrow. If you go ahead with the party, you risk making your community the target of a revenge attack. If you don’t, you risk losing all of the money you’ve invested in the inauguration, and you won’t be able to make your report deadline. Who are you accountable to and what should you do?

Considerations:

- There should be no hesitation - you cancel or postpone the inauguration.
- You are more accountable to the community than to your donors, especially if their safety is at stake.
- You contact your donor and explain the situation. They should give you an extension and the space to make adjustments
CDA
One Alewife Center, Suite 400
Cambridge, MA 02140-2315 USA

feedback@cdacollaborative.org
www.cdacollaborative.org